

## Report and recommendation for Station Property Sub Committee, Saltash Town Council

1. We received five responses to the Invitation to Quote, which were separately evaluated by Richard Bickford, Christina Dixon and Hilary Bracegirdle against the criteria set out in the Invitation:

### **Relevant experience of the project team (40%)**

(such as experience of working with historic buildings; Experience of involving the community; Experience of creating mixed use buildings; Experience of working within grant conditions from public bodies or foundations; Strength and breadth of project team including subcontracted consultants)

### **Robustness of proposed methodology in response to the brief (40%)**

#### **Price (20%)**

2. A table of the combined marking is provided below. In summary, the results are:

Bailey Partnership	27.5
Le Page Architects <sup>1</sup>	25
Ercle	21.5
S34 Architecture (Ian Taylor)	20
Space Design Architecture	15

3. **We therefore recommend that Bailey Partnership be appointed to the role with fees of £8200 to be paid from the Station Project Development budget**

Bailey Partnership provided a well set-out response which responded excellently to the brief. Their methodology which showed a clear understanding of the process. Their project team has excellent breadth and strength (they employ over 100 staff across five offices) and includes conservation architects, QS, and project managers. They provided clear evidence of relevant experience with listed buildings such as The Millfields and The Museum of Rural Life, and have worked within grant conditions. They have also a track record of working with community groups and town councils; a very interesting example is their creation of work hubs in listed buildings in Torbay. They have also delivered projects with mixed uses such as cafes/bars/restaurants. They were the only respondent to mention the importance of environmental measures, which is good practice and which funders generally expect.

4. However, Bailey Architects did not give an estimate of RIBA stages 4 – 7. Although this is not part of the assessment at this stage, and the project will be retendered anyway, it would be prudent to have a discussion about this at their inception meeting. Also, the daily rate for their Director is relatively high so it will be very important to manage the project closely, to avoid the need to buy in additional hours from him.

---

<sup>1</sup> Please note potential conflict of interest – Hilary B formerly chaired a committee of which Amanda le Page was a member and Le Page are appointed to work on Plympton Guildhall

## Scoring

Fee were as follows

Company A	£9600	Scored as 2
Company B	£8200	Scored as 4
Company C	£7665	Scored as 6
Company D	£7510	Scored as 6
Company E	£7450	Scored as 6

Note : where no consultant and surveyor fees were indicated a sum of £2610 was added to equalise the costs.

	Price (20%) (Max 6)	Relevant experience (40%) (Max 12)	Methodology (40%) (Max 12)	TOTALS
<b>IAN TAYLOR</b>				
CD		2	3	
RB		2	3	
HB		1	3	
Total		5	9	14
Price	6			6
FINAL SCORE				<b>20</b>
<b>SPACE</b>				
CD		2	1	
RB		2	1	
HB		2	1	
Total		6	3	9
Price	6			6
FINAL SCORE				<b>15</b>
<b>BAILEY</b>				
CD		3.5	4	
RB		4	4	
HB		4	4	
Total		11.5	12	23.5
Price	4			4
FINAL SCORE				<b>27.5</b>
<b>LE PAGE</b>				
CD		4	2	
RB		4	2	
HB		4	3	
Total		12	7	19
Price	6			6
FINAL SCORE				<b>25</b>

ERCLE				
CD		3	3	
RB		2.5	3	
HB		4	4	
Total		9.5	10	19.5
Price	2			2
FINAL SCORE				<b>21.5</b>

### Introduction to Bailey Partnership (taken from their response)

'Bailey Partnership is a multidisciplinary practice, employing over a 100 staff, within 5 offices across the South of England, Saltash Station will be supported primarily by the Plymouth Office that has specialist staff with experience of this type of project.

We are an award winning architectural led multidisciplinary consultancy and can offer a wide range of disciplines in house. We have chartered architectural practice within the overall multidisciplinary organisation, and have Chartered Architects, including conservation specialisms, Chartered Interior Designers, Chartered Architectural Technologists and a support team of architectural assistants, BIM coordinators and technicians. In addition, we have in house cost consultants / quantity surveyors, town planners, project managers, building surveyors, mechanical and electrical building services engineers and principal designers, all with refurbishment and historic building experience. Where necessary we can utilise our experienced historic building consultancy, using an RICS accredited conservation surveyor, to advise on heritage aspects of the project.

Established in 1971, Bailey Partnership has steadily grown into one of the top small/medium sized consultancies, now employing around 100 staff in offices across the South of England.

The Practice is well used to working collaboratively on community refurbishment and regeneration projects with local authorities, town councils, community groups as well as multi-stakeholder project boards and project working groups.

The team are well versed in local authority procedures, reporting structures and governance requirements. Within the practice we have specialist conservation architects, technologists and surveyors and have an excellent track record with historic buildings and community projects, particularly the conversion of heritage buildings.

Our team is well positioned to undertake community projects and have a strong record of engagement, listening and delivery of successful, sustainable projects. We have current experience of assisting with bids in relation to HLF funded projects. We are currently working with Cornwall Council on projects spanning several frameworks and individual appointments, including the rationalisation of Cornwall Council offices and functions across the county and many school and nursery projects.

Locally, aside from our previous involvement with Saltash Train Station, we have also been involved with a number of schemes within Saltash, including the club changing facilities at Salt Mill Park (in conjunction with Groundwork Trust), and proposals for the renovation of the Scouts Water Activity Centre. We have also developed business parks and apartments.'